CPF VS. 401(K)

## A TWENTY-FIVE YEAR COMPARISON (1995-2019)

## IT'S NO CONTEST

## CPF vs. 401(k)

THREE CRITICAL 401(K) CONSIDERATIONS WHEN A 401(k) PLAN IS YOUR PRIMARY SOURCE OF RETIREMENT INCOME:
I. Life Expectancy
II. Investment Costs
III. The 4\% Rule

## CPF vs. 401(k)

## I. CURRENT U.S. LIFE EXPECTANCIES:

- Men: At age 65 have $50 \%$ chance of living beyond age 85 --- and $25 \%$ chance of living beyond 90 .
- Women: At age 65 have $50 \%$ chance of living beyond age 87 --- and $25 \%$ chance of living beyond age 92.
- Couples: At age 65 have $50 \%$ chance that one will live beyond age 90 and $25 \%$ chance that one will live beyond age 94 .


## CPF vs. 401(k)

## II. INVESTMENT COSTS:

- Average Investment Costs in 401(k) Plans: 1.07\%
III. THE "4\% PAYOUT RULE"
- Experts Agree That in Retirement 401(k) Participants Should Pay Themselves No More than 4\% Each Year
- Example: If 401(k) Balance at Retirement = \$500,000 Annual 4\% Payout $=\$ 20,000$ a Year (\$1,667/month).
- This Payout Produces a 90\% Chance of the Benefit Lasting 30 Years.


## CPF vs. 401(k)

1995-2019

## COMPARISON OF THE BENEFIT EARNED WITH CPF VERSUS A 401(K) USING THE FOLLOWING ASSUMPTIONS:

- CPF's benefit accrual rate had been 1.25\% for all years (although for many years prior to 2009 the rate was higher)
- Annual contributions to CPF and 401(k) of \$10,000 (2,000 hours @\$5/ hour) for all years.
- 401(k) invested in a portfolio of 100\% S\&P 500 Stock Index Fund (highest risk); or 50\% S\&P 500 Stock Index Fund and 50\% Bloomberg Barclay's Aggregate Bond Index Fund (medium risk); or 100\% Bloomberg Barclay's Aggregate Bond Index Fund (lowest risk) for all years.
- A 1.07\% average annual 401(k) investment cost for all years.
- A 4\% payout of the 401(k) benefit.


## S\&P to CPF Benefit Comparison

## 1995-2019

| Central Pension Fund |  |  | 401(k) |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Year | Annual Contribution | Annual Balance | Annual Contribution | $\begin{gathered} \hline \text { S\&P } 500 \\ \text { Index* } \end{gathered}$ | Annual Balance |
| 1995 | \$10,000 | \$10,000 | \$10,000 | 36.51\% | \$13,651 |
| 1996 | \$10,000 | \$20,000 | \$10,000 | 21.89\% | \$28,828 |
| 1997 | \$10,000 | \$30,000 | \$10,000 | 32.29\% | \$51,367 |
| 1998 | \$10,000 | \$40,000 | \$10,000 | 27.51\% | \$78,248 |
| 1999 | \$10,000 | \$50,000 | \$10,000 | 19.97\% | \$105,872 |
| 2000 | \$10,000 | \$60,000 | \$10,000 | -10.17\% | \$104,083 |
| 2001 | \$10,000 | \$70,000 | \$10,000 | -12.96\% | \$99,303 |
| 2002 | \$10,000 | \$80,000 | \$10,000 | -23.17\% | \$83,977 |
| 2003 | \$10,000 | \$90,000 | \$10,000 | 27.61\% | \$119,928 |
| 2004 | \$10,000 | \$100,000 | \$10,000 | 9.81\% | \$142,677 |
| 2005 | \$10,000 | \$110,000 | \$10,000 | 3.84\% | \$158,543 |
| 2006 | \$10,000 | \$120,000 | \$10,000 | 14.72\% | \$193,359 |
| 2007 | \$10,000 | \$130,000 | \$10,000 | 4.42\% | \$212,356 |
| 2008 | \$10,000 | \$140,000 | \$10,000 | -38.07\% | \$137,710 |
| 2009 | \$10,000 | \$150,000 | \$10,000 | 25.39\% | \$185,220 |
| 2010 | \$10,000 | \$160,000 | \$10,000 | 13.99\% | \$222,538 |
| 2011 | \$10,000 | \$170,000 | \$10,000 | 1.04\% | \$234,960 |
| 2012 | \$10,000 | \$180,000 | \$10,000 | 14.93\% | \$281,541 |
| 2013 | \$10,000 | \$190,000 | \$10,000 | 31.32\% | \$382,852 |
| 2014 | \$10,000 | \$200,000 | \$10,000 | 12.62\% | \$442,430 |
| 2015 | \$10,000 | \$210,000 | \$10,000 | 0.31\% | \$453,850 |
| 2016 | \$10,000 | \$220,000 | \$10,000 | 10.89\% | \$514,363 |
| 2017 | \$10,000 | \$230,000 | \$10,000 | 20.76\% | \$633,221 |
| 2018 | \$10,000 | \$240,000 | \$10,000 | -5.45\% | \$608,165 |
| 2019 | \$10,000 | \$250,000 | \$10,000 | 30.42\% | \$806,211 |
|  | ent Benefit ** | \$3,125 |  | Benefit *** | \$2,687 |

[^0]| Central Pension Fund |  |  | 401(k) |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Year | Annual Contribution | Annual Balance | Annual Contribution | BC Aggregate Index ${ }^{\text {* }}$ | Annual Balance |
| 1995 | \$10,000 | \$10,000 | \$10,000 | 17.41\% | \$11,741 |
| 1996 | \$10,000 | \$20,000 | \$10,000 | 2.54\% | \$22,294 |
| 1997 | \$10,000 | \$30,000 | \$10,000 | 8.61\% | \$35,076 |
| 1998 | \$10,000 | \$40,000 | \$10,000 | 7.60\% | \$48,503 |
| 1999 | \$10,000 | \$50,000 | \$10,000 | -1.90\% | \$57,391 |
| 2000 | \$10,000 | \$60,000 | \$10,000 | 10.56\% | \$74,508 |
| 2001 | \$10,000 | \$70,000 | \$10,000 | 7.36\% | \$90,725 |
| 2002 | \$10,000 | \$80,000 | \$10,000 | 9.20\% | \$109,991 |
| 2003 | \$10,000 | \$90,000 | \$10,000 | 3.04\% | \$123,636 |
| 2004 | \$10,000 | \$100,000 | \$10,000 | 3.27\% | \$138,004 |
| 2005 | \$10,000 | \$110,000 | \$10,000 | 1.36\% | \$150,019 |
| 2006 | \$10,000 | \$120,000 | \$10,000 | 3.27\% | \$165,249 |
| 2007 | \$10,000 | \$130,000 | \$10,000 | 5.90\% | \$185,583 |
| 2008 | \$10,000 | \$140,000 | \$10,000 | 4.17\% | \$203,739 |
| 2009 | \$10,000 | \$150,000 | \$10,000 | 4.86\% | \$224,128 |
| 2010 | \$10,000 | \$160,000 | \$10,000 | 5.47\% | \$246,939 |
| 2011 | \$10,000 | \$170,000 | \$10,000 | 6.77\% | \$274,338 |
| 2012 | \$10,000 | \$180,000 | \$10,000 | 3.14\% | \$293,266 |
| 2013 | \$10,000 | \$190,000 | \$10,000 | -3.09\% | \$293,895 |
| 2014 | \$10,000 | \$200,000 | \$10,000 | 4.90\% | \$318,786 |
| 2015 | \$10,000 | \$210,000 | \$10,000 | -0.52\% | \$327,076 |
| 2016 | \$10,000 | \$220,000 | \$10,000 | 1.58\% | \$342,392 |
| 2017 | \$10,000 | \$230,000 | \$10,000 | 2.47\% | \$361,103 |
| 2018 | \$10,000 | \$240,000 | \$10,000 | -1.06\% | \$367,170 |
| 2019 | \$10,000 | \$250,000 | \$10,000 | 7.65\% | \$406,023 |
| Current Benefit ** |  | \$3,125 | Monthly Benefit *** |  | \$1,353 |

[^1]
## 50-50 to CPF Benefit Comparison <br> 1995-2019

| Central Pension Fund |  |  | 401(k) |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Year | Annual Contribution | Annual Balance | Annual Contribution | 50\% Stock50\% Bond Blend* | Annual Balance |
| 1995 | \$10,000 | \$10,000 | \$10,000 | 26.96\% | \$12,696 |
| 1996 | \$10,000 | \$20,000 | \$10,000 | 12.22\% | \$25,469 |
| 1997 | \$10,000 | \$30,000 | \$10,000 | 20.45\% | \$42,723 |
| 1998 | \$10,000 | \$40,000 | \$10,000 | 17.56\% | \$61,979 |
| 1999 | \$10,000 | \$50,000 | \$10,000 | 9.04\% | \$78,483 |
| 2000 | \$10,000 | \$60,000 | \$10,000 | 0.19\% | \$88,654 |
| 2001 | \$10,000 | \$70,000 | \$10,000 | -2.80\% | \$95,892 |
| 2002 | \$10,000 | \$80,000 | \$10,000 | -6.99\% | \$98,495 |
| 2003 | \$10,000 | \$90,000 | \$10,000 | 15.33\% | \$125,122 |
| 2004 | \$10,000 | \$100,000 | \$10,000 | 6.54\% | \$143,960 |
| 2005 | \$10,000 | \$110,000 | \$10,000 | 2.60\% | \$157,966 |
| 2006 | \$10,000 | \$120,000 | \$10,000 | 9.00\% | \$183,077 |
| 2007 | \$10,000 | \$130,000 | \$10,000 | 5.16\% | \$203,040 |
| 2008 | \$10,000 | \$140,000 | \$10,000 | -16.95\% | \$176,932 |
| 2009 | \$10,000 | \$150,000 | \$10,000 | 15.13\% | \$215,211 |
| 2010 | \$10,000 | \$160,000 | \$10,000 | 9.73\% | \$247,129 |
| 2011 | \$10,000 | \$170,000 | \$10,000 | 3.91\% | \$267,175 |
| 2012 | \$10,000 | \$180,000 | \$10,000 | 9.04\% | \$302,222 |
| 2013 | \$10,000 | \$190,000 | \$10,000 | 14.12\% | \$356,292 |
| 2014 | \$10,000 | \$200,000 | \$10,000 | 8.76\% | \$398,379 |
| 2015 | \$10,000 | \$210,000 | \$10,000 | -0.10\% | \$407,958 |
| 2016 | \$10,000 | \$220,000 | \$10,000 | 6.23\% | \$444,012 |
| 2017 | \$10,000 | \$230,000 | \$10,000 | 11.62\% | \$506,750 |
| 2018 | \$10,000 | \$240,000 | \$10,000 | -3.26\% | \$499,930 |
| 2019 | \$10,000 | \$250,000 | \$10,000 | 19.04\% | \$606,995 |
| Current Benefit** |  | \$3,125 | Mon | nefit *** | \$2,023 |

[^2]
## CONCLUSION

Using the last 25 years of market returns, and even assuming CPF's accrual rate was $1.25 \%$ for all years, would have provided a guaranteed lifetime monthly benefit that is higher than could be expected from a 401(k) account, which is NOT guaranteed, under any scenario.
\$3,125 versus \$2,687 a month, or
\$3,125 versus \$2,023 a month, or \$3,125 versus \$1,353.

IT'S NO CONTEST!


[^0]:    * S\&P 500 Index reduced by average annual 401(k) fee of $1.07 \%$ (Source 401 k Averages Book, Avg of Large and Small Plan 2019)
    ${ }^{* *}$ CPF benefit based on $1.25 \%$ benefit accrual rate for all contributions
    ${ }^{* * *} 401(\mathrm{k})$ benefit based on annual payout rate of $4 \%$ of fixed account balance

[^1]:    * BB Aggregate Index reduced by average annual 401(k) fee of 1.07\% (Source 401k Averages Book, Avg of Large and Small Plan 2019)
    ** CPF benefit based on $1.25 \%$ benefit accrual rate for all contributions
    *** $401(\mathrm{k})$ benefit based on annual payout rate of $4 \%$ of fixed account balance

[^2]:    * Stock returns from S\&P 500 Index; Bond returns from Bloomberg Barclays Aggregate Bond Index

    Both reduced by average annual 401(k) fee of 1.07\% (Source 401k Averages Book, Avg of Large and Small Plan 2019)
    ${ }^{* z}$ CPF Benefit Accrual Rate @ $1.25 \%$ For All Years
    ** 401 (k) Benefit Paid @ 4\% of Account Balance Annually

