

CPF VS. 401(K)

A TWENTY-FIVE YEAR COMPARISON (1995 - 2019) IT'S NO CONTEST



THREE CRITICAL 401(K) CONSIDERATIONS WHEN A 401(k) PLAN IS YOUR PRIMARY SOURCE OF RETIREMENT INCOME:

- I. Life Expectancy
- II. Investment Costs
- III. The 4% Rule



I. CURRENT U.S. LIFE EXPECTANCIES:

- Men: At age 65 have 50% chance of living beyond age 85 --- and 25% chance of living beyond 90.
- Women: At age 65 have 50% chance of living beyond age 87 --- and 25% chance of living beyond age 92.
- Couples: At age 65 have 50% chance that one will live beyond age 90 and 25% chance that one will live beyond age 94.



II. INVESTMENT COSTS:

Average Investment Costs in 401(k) Plans: 1.07%

III. THE "4% PAYOUT RULE"

- Experts Agree That in Retirement 401(k) Participants Should Pay Themselves No More than 4% Each Year
- Example: If 401(k) Balance at Retirement = \$500,000 Annual 4%
 Payout = \$20,000 a Year (\$1,667/month).
- This Payout Produces a 90% Chance of the Benefit Lasting 30 Years.

Source: 401k Averages Book, Average of Large and Small Plans, 2019



1995 - 2019

COMPARISON OF THE BENEFIT EARNED WITH CPF VERSUS A 401(K) USING THE FOLLOWING ASSUMPTIONS:

- CPF's benefit accrual rate had been 1.25% for all years (although for many years prior to 2009 the rate was higher)
- Annual contributions to CPF and 401(k) of \$10,000 (2,000 hours @\$5/hour) for all years.
- 401(k) invested in a portfolio of 100% S&P 500 Stock Index Fund (highest risk); or 50% S&P 500 Stock Index Fund and 50% Bloomberg Barclay's Aggregate Bond Index Fund (medium risk); or 100% Bloomberg Barclay's Aggregate Bond Index Fund (lowest risk) for all years.
- A 1.07% average annual 401(k) investment cost for all years.
- A 4% payout of the 401(k) benefit.

S&P to CPF Benefit Comparison



1995 - 2019

Central Pension Fund				401(k)					
	Annual	Annual		Annual		S&P 500		Annual	
Year	Contribution	Balance		Contribution		Index*		Balance	
1995	\$10,000	\$10,000		\$10,000		36.51%		\$13,651	
1996	\$10,000	\$20,000		\$10,000		21.89%		\$28,828	
1997	\$10,000	\$30,000		\$10,000		32.29%		\$51,367	
1998	\$10,000	\$40,000		\$10,000		27.51%		\$78,248	
1999	\$10,000	\$50,000		\$10,000		19.97%		\$105,872	
2000	\$10,000	\$60,000		\$10,000		-10.17%		\$104,083	
2001	\$10,000	\$70,000		\$10,000		-12.96%		\$99,303	
2002	\$10,000	\$80,000		\$10,000		-23.17%		\$83,977	
2003	\$10,000	\$90,000		\$10,000		27.61%		\$119,928	
2004	\$10,000	\$100,000		\$10,000		9.81%		\$142,677	
2005	\$10,000	\$110,000		\$10,000		3.84%		\$158,543	
2006	\$10,000	\$120,000		\$10,000		14.72%		\$193,359	
2007	\$10,000	\$130,000		\$10,000		4.42%		\$212,356	
2008	\$10,000	\$140,000		\$10,000		-38.07%		\$137,710	
2009	\$10,000	\$150,000		\$10,000		25.39%		\$185,220	
2010	\$10,000	\$160,000		\$10,000		13.99%		\$222,538	
2011	\$10,000	\$170,000		\$10,000		1.04%		\$234,960	
2012	\$10,000	\$180,000		\$10,000		14.93%		\$281,541	
2013	\$10,000	\$190,000		\$10,000		31.32%		\$382,852	
2014	\$10,000	\$200,000		\$10,000		12.62%		\$442,430	
2015	\$10,000	\$210,000		\$10,000		0.31%		\$453,850	
2016	\$10,000	\$220,000		\$10,000		10.89%		\$514,363	
2017	\$10,000	\$230,000		\$10,000		20.76%		\$633,221	
2018	\$10,000	\$240,000		\$10,000		-5.45%		\$608,165	
2019	\$10,000	\$250,000		\$10,000		30.42%		\$806,211	
Current Benefit ** \$3,125]	Мо	nth	ly Benefit ***		\$2,687	

^{*} S&P 500 Index reduced by average annual 401(k) fee of 1.07% (Source 401k Averages Book, Avg of Large and Small Plan 2019)

^{**} CPF benefit based on 1.25% benefit accrual rate for all contributions

^{*** 401(}k) benefit based on annual payout rate of 4% of fixed account balance

BB Aggregate to CPF Benefit Comparison



1995 - 2019

	Central Pension	n Fund	401(k)					
	Annual	Annual	Annual		BC Aggregate		Annual	
Year	Contribution	Balance	Contribution		Index*		Balance	
1995	\$10,000	\$10,000	\$10,000		17.41%		\$11,741	
1996	\$10,000	\$20,000	\$10,000		2.54%		\$22,294	
1997	\$10,000	\$30,000	\$10,000		8.61%		\$35,076	
1998	\$10,000	\$40,000	\$10,000		7.60%		\$48,503	
1999	\$10,000	\$50,000	\$10,000		-1.90%		\$57,391	
2000	\$10,000	\$60,000	\$10,000		10.56%		\$74,508	
2001	\$10,000	\$70,000	\$10,000		7.36%		\$90,725	
2002	\$10,000	\$80,000	\$10,000		9.20%		\$109,991	
2003	\$10,000	\$90,000	\$10,000		3.04%		\$123,636	
2004	\$10,000	\$100,000	\$10,000		3.27%		\$138,004	
2005	\$10,000	\$110,000	\$10,000		1.36%		\$150,019	
2006	\$10,000	\$120,000	\$10,000		3.27%		\$165,249	
2007	\$10,000	\$130,000	\$10,000		5.90%		\$185,583	
2008	\$10,000	\$140,000	\$10,000		4.17%		\$203,739	
2009	\$10,000	\$150,000	\$10,000		4.86%		\$224,128	
2010	\$10,000	\$160,000	\$10,000		5.47%		\$246,939	
2011	\$10,000	\$170,000	\$10,000		6.77%		\$274,338	
2012	\$10,000	\$180,000	\$10,000		3.14%		\$293,266	
2013	\$10,000	\$190,000	\$10,000		-3.09%		\$293,895	
2014	\$10,000	\$200,000	\$10,000		4.90%		\$318,786	
2015	\$10,000	\$210,000	\$10,000		-0.52%		\$327,076	
2016	\$10,000	\$220,000	\$10,000		1.58%		\$342,392	
2017	\$10,000	\$230,000	\$10,000		2.47%		\$361,103	
2018	\$10,000	\$240,000	\$10,000		-1.06%		\$367,170	
2019	\$10,000	\$250,000	\$10,000		7.65%		\$406,023	
(Current Benefit **	\$3,125		Mor	thly Benefit ***		\$1,353	

^{*} BB Aggregate Index reduced by average annual 401(k) fee of 1.07% (Source 401k Averages Book, Avg of Large and Small Plan 2019)

^{**} CPF benefit based on 1.25% benefit accrual rate for all contributions

^{*** 401(}k) benefit based on annual payout rate of 4% of fixed account balance

50-50 to CPF Benefit Comparison



1995 - 2019

Central Pension Fund				401(k)					
						50% Stock-			
	Annual	Annual		Annual		50% Bond		Annual	
Year	Contribution	Balance		Contribution		Blend*		Balance	
1995	\$10,000	\$10,000		\$10,000		26.96%		\$12,696	
1996	\$10,000	\$20,000		\$10,000		12.22%		\$25,469	
1997	\$10,000	\$30,000		\$10,000		20.45%		\$42,723	
1998	\$10,000	\$40,000		\$10,000		17.56%		\$61,979	
1999	\$10,000	\$50,000		\$10,000		9.04%		\$78,483	
2000	\$10,000	\$60,000		\$10,000		0.19%		\$88,654	
2001	\$10,000	\$70,000		\$10,000		-2.80%		\$95,892	
2002	\$10,000	\$80,000		\$10,000		-6.99%		\$98,495	
2003	\$10,000	\$90,000		\$10,000		15.33%		\$125,122	
2004	\$10,000	\$100,000		\$10,000		6.54%		\$143,960	
2005	\$10,000	\$110,000		\$10,000		2.60%		\$157,966	
2006	\$10,000	\$120,000		\$10,000		9.00%		\$183,077	
2007	\$10,000	\$130,000		\$10,000		5.16%		\$203,040	
2008	\$10,000	\$140,000		\$10,000		-16.95%		\$176,932	
2009	\$10,000	\$150,000		\$10,000		15.13%		\$215,211	
2010	\$10,000	\$160,000		\$10,000		9.73%		\$247,129	
2011	\$10,000	\$170,000		\$10,000		3.91%		\$267,175	
2012	\$10,000	\$180,000		\$10,000		9.04%		\$302,222	
2013	\$10,000	\$190,000		\$10,000		14.12%		\$356,292	
2014	\$10,000	\$200,000		\$10,000		8.76%		\$398,379	
2015	\$10,000	\$210,000		\$10,000		-0.10%		\$407,958	
2016	\$10,000	\$220,000		\$10,000		6.23%		\$444,012	
2017	\$10,000	\$230,000		\$10,000		11.62%		\$506,750	
2018	\$10,000	\$240,000		\$10,000		-3.26%		\$499,930	
2019	\$10,000	\$250,000		\$10,000		19.04%		\$606,995	
Current Benefit**		\$3,125		Month	hly Be	nefit ***		\$2,023	

^{*} Stock returns from S&P 500 Index; Bond returns from Bloomberg Barclays Aggregate Bond Index

Both reduced by average annual 401(k) fee of 1.07% (Source 401k Averages Book, Avg of Large and Small Plan 2019)

^{**} CPF Benefit Accrual Rate @ 1.25% For All Years

^{** 401 (}k) Benefit Paid @ 4% of Account Balance Annually



CONCLUSION

Using the last 25 years of market returns, and even assuming CPF's accrual rate was 1.25% for all years, would have provided a <u>guaranteed lifetime</u> monthly benefit that is higher than could be expected from a 401(k) account, which is <u>NOT guaranteed</u>, under any scenario.

\$3,125 versus \$2,687 a month, or \$3,125 versus \$2,023 a month, or \$3,125 versus \$1,353.

IT'S NO CONTEST!